

# Kentucky Trial Court Review

The Most Current and Complete Summary of Kentucky Jury Verdicts

October 2012

Published in Louisville, Kentucky Since 1997

16 K.T.C.R. 10

*Fifteen Years of Comprehensive Statewide Jury Verdict Coverage*

## Civil Jury Verdicts

Complete and timely coverage of civil jury verdicts including circuit, division, presiding judge, parties, case number, attorneys and results.

**Premises Liability - The plaintiff tripped on a curb in a Target parking lot and sustained a broken hip – a federal jury awarded her medicals of \$50,936 but nothing for pain and suffering – over the plaintiff's objection the trial judge sent the jury to deliberate – in the second verdict the plaintiff took \$5,000 for pain and suffering – the plaintiff has since moved for a new trial**

*Edwards v. Target*, 3:11-138

Plaintiff: Joseph H. Mattingly, III and Kaelin G. Reed, *Mattingly Nally-Martin & Fowler*, Lebanon and Dallas E. George, Lebanon

Defense: Richard P. Schiller and Noel R. Halpin, *Schiller Osbourn Barnes & Maloney*, Louisville

Verdict: \$50,936 for plaintiff less 90% comparative fault (1<sup>st</sup> verdict)

\$55,936 for plaintiff less 90% comparative fault (2<sup>nd</sup> verdict)

Federal: **Louisville**, J. Russell, 9-18-12

Mary Edwards, then age 63, shopped on 2-27-10 at the Target retail store in Elizabethtown. She had traveled with her husband from Greensburg. They parked at the side of the store. Having finished her shopping, Edwards returned to the parking lot to go to her car.

At this Target location there were concrete parking bumpers in front of the parking spots. However in an odd alignment, the bumpers were not directly in front of the parking spots – they straddled the parking spots and created a partial obstacle.

Edwards didn't appreciate that obstacle and as she walked to her car, she tripped and fell. Landing hard on the asphalt, she sustained a broken hip. There was undisputed evidence from

\* \* \* Do you have the 14<sup>th</sup> Edition yet? \* \* \*

Also Available in a PDF Format

Order The KTCR 2011 Year in Review

Another year has passed and around here, that means it's time to ship out the 2011 Year in Review Volume. The 2011 edition, the **fourteenth** in the series (it's hard to believe it's been fourteen years), is the best ever, topping out at *720 pages and chronicling 4,693 verdicts*. This year it is available not just in the print edition, but also separately as a PDF file. [Search the entire document from your computer. No more carpal tunnel claims sifting through the pages.] Both versions, with different utilities, cost the same.

Besides all the jury verdicts, readers have access to fourteen years of encyclopedic data on medical verdicts, car wrecks, slip and fall trials, bad faith and on and on. There is a new report on the largest pain and suffering verdicts from 1998 to the present

If it's important to lawyers that try or settle civil tort cases, it's in The Book.

Don't guess the value of a case or a particular claim.

**Read the Book and know what it's worth.**

*See the backpage to order or call us*

**Order the KTCR 2011 Year in Review**

*Just \$255.00 plus tax (\$270.30 for KY residents)*

*Call us toll-free at 1-866-228-2447 to pay by credit card or simply complete the order form in this issue.*

**Now Available in Print Edition and PDF Format**

Edwards herself and witnesses to the fall that it was a painful event. She underwent a surgical repair and remained in the hospital for 14 days. Edwards was homebound for 6 weeks thereafter.

The incurred medical bills were \$50,936. She claimed \$3,000 for future care. Her lost wages totaled \$4,200, the plaintiff seeking \$62,000 for impairment. Pain and suffering was limited in the instructions to \$450,000. Her husband also presented a consortium claim.

In this lawsuit (removed to federal court by Target), Edwards alleged the

premises were not reasonably safe. She focused on the straddle design of the parking bumpers. The danger was compounded as the parking spots were next to the building – the space between the parking bumpers and the store essentially created a pedestrian pathway, pedestrians then having to dangerously navigate the straddled parking bumpers.

Target's defense was elegantly simple. The parking bumpers had a very specific purpose – it was to prevent vehicles from striking the building. Edwards simply failed to appreciate the open and obvious

**Kentucky Trial Court Review**  
**October 2012**  
**Table of Contents**

**Verdicts**

**Jefferson County**

Housing Negligence - *A resident of public housing linked a respiratory illness to mold, the mold developing because her apartment had poor drainage* - Defense p. 4

Dogbite - *While walking her dog in St. Matthews, the plaintiff was rushed by the defendant's dog that had broken loose – as the rogue dog fought with the plaintiff's dog, the plaintiff tried to separate the dogs – her index finger was bitten off in the process* - Defense p. 5

FELA - *A switchman for a railroad sustained a disc injury when a switch stuck as he was turning it* - \$213,262 p. 6

Auto Negligence - *A disputed red light collision was resolved for the defendant on liability* - Defense p. 9

**Federal Court - Louisville**

Premises Liability - *The plaintiff fell in a Target parking lot and suffered a broken hip – a federal jury awarded her medicals and nothing for suffering – sent to deliberate again, she took \$5,000 for pain and suffering* - \$50,936 and \$55,936 p. 1

**Webster County**

Truck Negligence - *Proceeding blindly through a burst of coal dust, the defendant rear-ended the plaintiff, the impact resulting in a meniscal injury* - \$78,562 p. 3

**Franklin County**

Medical Negligence - *An infant's death following a sudden at-home delivery was blamed on a pediatrician's failure to establish an airway in treating a collapsed lung* - Defense p. 4

**Laurel County**

Products Liability - *The plaintiff was crushed to death under a heavy security gate – his estate blamed the manufacturer for its improper installation* - Defense p. 4

Underinsured Motorist - *A rear-end crash was linked to the aggravation of degenerative conditions – the verdict for the plaintiff exceeded a \$25,000 floor of UIM coverage* - \$58,813 p. 8

**Federal Court - Lexington**

Medical Negligence - *Despite a "priority" order to biopsy a lump under the arm of a federal prisoner plaintiff, no biopsy was performed for 18 months – by the time the biopsy was performed, the plaintiff's cancer had reached a fulminant state* - \$975,000 p. 5

**Boyd County**

Medical Negligence - *A technical error was alleged in the performance of a heart bypass surgery* - Defense p. 6

Dog Attack - *The defendant's dog were blamed for attacking the plaintiff's prized pet white tail deer* - \$3,267 p. 8

**Johnson County**

Auto Negligence - *Three plaintiffs complained of wide-ranging soft-tissue symptoms after a minor rear-ender* - Defense p. 6

**Kenton County**

Medical Negligence - *A radiologist was blamed for misreading a portable chest x-ray regarding the placement of a central line – he thought the line was in an artery and not a vein* - Defense p. 7

**A Notable Out of State Verdict**

**Nashville, Tennessee**

Medical Negligence - *An infant sustained a hypoxic birth injury – this was the third time the case was tried* - \$13,623,000 p. 9