

The Tennessee Jury Verdict Reporter

The Most Current and Complete Summary of Tennessee Jury Verdicts

May 2013

Statewide Jury Verdict Coverage

10 TJVR 5

Tennessee's Source for Jury Verdicts Since 2004

In This Issue

Davidson County

Products Liability - Defense p. 2
Auto Negligence - \$37,046 p. 7
Auto Negligence - \$10,000 p. 10

Shelby County

Medical Negligence - \$1,308,808 p. 1
Auto Negligence - \$49,783 p. 8
Auto Negligence - \$16,340 p. 9
Auto Negligence - \$50,000 p. 11

Knox County

Golf Course Negligence - Defense p. 4

Hamilton County

Uninsured Motorist - \$67,000 p. 5

Federal Court - Memphis

Employment Retaliation - \$450,213 p. 5

Coffee County

Auto Negligence - \$20,159 p. 7

McNairy County

Ins. Agent Negligence - Defense p. 7

Federal Court- Nashville

Excessive Force - Defense p. 8

Anderson County

Premises Liability - Directed verdict p. 9

Rutherford County

Auto Negligence - \$51,623 p. 10

Civil Jury Verdicts

Timely coverage of civil jury verdicts in Tennessee including court, division, presiding judge, parties, case number, attorneys and results.

*****Order the 2012 TJVR Year in Review*****

It's time to order - Shipping this month

The TJVR 2012 Year in Review

(The Eighth Edition)

This remarkable volume summarizes 2,172 civil jury verdict in Tennessee since 2004. It is the essential tool for lawyers that try or settle cases.

Order the 2012 TJVR Year in Review for \$225.00.

Use the order form on the backpage or call us toll-free at 1-866-228-2447 to pay by MC/Visa/Amex

Medical Negligence - An elderly woman suffered an infection to her ankle and foot while it was in a cast following a fall - because the infection had not improved after several weeks of treatment, she elected to have her leg amputated below the knee - this suit against her orthopedist followed

Martin v. Campbell Clinic, P.C., 5948-07

Plaintiff: Les Jones and Tannera George Gibson, *Burch Porter & Johnson*, Memphis

Defense: Buckner Wellford and Jennifer Sink, *Baker Donelson Bearman Caldwell & Berkowitz*, Memphis

Verdict: \$1,308,808 for plaintiff less 25% comparative fault

Court: **Shelby**

Judge: Robert L. Childers

Date: 1-23-13

On 11-23-06, Peggy Martin, then age 72 with a history of peripheral vascular disease and smoking, fell and turned her left ankle. She initially went to the emergency room the day of the fall, and then saw Dr. Gregory Dabov about a week later at Campbell Clinic in Southaven, MS. An x-ray taken at that time showed that she had fractured her ankle, and she was placed in a walking cast and told to return after one week. At the time, she had no skin changes or palpable masses on either of her lower extremities. However, her chart noted equal but weak pulses.

Martin returned to the clinic on 12-

11 for a follow-up, at which time Dabov decided to leave her in the cast. She was told to return in another four weeks for an x-ray and exam. When she returned on 1-8-07, the cast was removed, and it was discovered that Martin had developed a heel ulcer, as well as dark eschar and sloughing of the skin on the dorsum of her foot. She was told to return in two weeks for a wound check.

On 1-22, Martin returned with a large eschar on the dorsum and over her heel. She was referred to a plastic surgeon wound care specialist. By 2-9, the ulcers on Martin's left ankle and heel were infected, and the area on her dorsum was a large ulcer with an exposed tendon. After a hospital admission and several weeks of wound therapy and debridement, Martin elected to undergo a below-the-knee amputation on 3-12-07.

Martin's suit against the Campbell Clinic alleged Dabov's failure to provide the correct method of treatment, to properly monitor and examine her foot after placing her in a cast, to take reasonable steps following the injury to prevent permanency and to reduce the nature and extent of the injury. She claimed that on the 12-11-06 visit, she presented with complaints of pain that were ignored by Dabov. She believed that on that date, her cast should have been removed, given that she showed signs of echymosis at the time the cast was placed, as well as her history of peripheral vascular disease and smoking. She also believed that her next appointment should have been scheduled before 1-08-07. Her causation expert was Dr. Amelia Kiser, Family Medicine, Glasgow,

KY, and Dr. Thomas Myers, Orthopedist, Atlanta, GA served as plaintiff's standard of care expert.

The defense denied that Martin made any complaints prior to and including 12-11-06. Therefore, she either was not having any problems or was self-medicating with alcohol. It argued that Martin, who stood 5'2" and weighed 92 pounds, drank between one and four 12 ounce cans of beer every night. It also pointed to the fact that plaintiff had not refilled or used her prescription pain medication that had been prescribed at the emergency room on 11-23. Defendant believed it was unlikely that plaintiff had any skin breakdown as of the 12-11 visit. During her hospitalization in February, tests showed that the blood flow to her feet was significantly reduced. As such, the removal of the cast on 12-11 would have made no difference in whether Martin ultimately would have experienced skin breakdown. The defense's standard of care expert was Dr. Riley Jones, Orthopedic Surgeon, Memphis, while Dr. Susan Austin, Orthopedic Surgeon, Memphis, offered expert testimony as to causation.

The case was first tried in July 2012, but ended in a mistrial when the jury was unable to reach a unanimous verdict. When the case was tried again in January 2013, a Shelby County jury found that Campbell Clinic, through Dabov, had deviated from the standard of care and that Martin suffered injury as a result. However, the jury also found that Martin herself was 25% at fault for her injuries. It awarded \$108,808 for medicals, \$300,000 for physical and mental pain and suffering, \$300,000 for

disfigurement, \$300,000 for loss of enjoyment of life and \$300,000 for permanency. The judgment that followed reduced the total award of \$1,308,808 to \$981,606 for Martin's apportionment of fault.

Products Liability - A Mexican plaintiff driving a Ford Explorer died in a roll-over crash in Mexico – the crash was blamed on a combination of a defective Bridgewater tire and instability defects in the Explorer – as there was no jurisdiction over either Ford or Bridgewater in Mexico, the case was tried in Nashville with substantive Mexican law (particularly as related to damages) governing the case

Ramirez v. Bridgewater Tire et al, 05-1555

Plaintiff: Steve North, *North Law Office*, Madison, Richard L. Denney, *Denney & Barrett*, Norman, OK and Robert L. Langdon and Adam W. Graves, *Langdon & Emison*, Lexington, MO

Defense: Scott G. Edwards, *Hartline Dacus Barger Dreyer*, Dallas, TX and A. Scott Ross and J. Isaac Sanders, *Neal & Harwell*, Nashville for Bridgewater Tire

Stephen A. Marcum, *Marcum & Petroff*, Huntsville and Craig A. Morgan, Austin, TX for Ford Motor

Verdict: Defense verdict

Court: **Davidson**

Judge: Thomas W. Brothers

Date: 2-22-13

Jesus Ramirez was driving a 1998 Ford Explorer on 9-27-00 in the San Luis Potosi region of Mexico. The vehicle was outfitted with Bridgewater Tires. Suddenly a tire on the Explorer suffered a tread separation. This caused the SUV to roll over. Ramirez was killed in the

The Tennessee Jury Verdict Reporter 2012 Year in Review

Available in both a Print and PDF Format (Adobe)

Another year has passed and the one-of-a-kind text Tennessee litigators have relied upon since 2004 is back with its seventh edition. At nearly 500 pages, the TJVR 2012 Year in Review includes the complete verdict summary from every reported case in 2012. Beyond the full text of the verdict summaries, the Year in Review has all the reports that makes the individual cases useful – even better for this year, all the reports bring together a remarkable **seven** years of data in an encyclopedic format.

What else is included in 2012?

Combined Verdict Summary

Detailed won-loss percentages for every variety of case with average results by category.

Million Dollar Verdicts

How many were there in 2012? In what sort of cases were they returned? The report also summarizes all the results since 2004.

The Products Liability Report

Eight years of products verdicts in a snapshot format.

Other One-of-A-Kind Analysis

Beyond the articles above, the 2012 Book has a detailed review of all the death cases. Does your case involve punitives? We’ve got all the results since 2004 sorted by tortious conduct. How have loss of consortium claims been valued?

If it's important to litigators, it's in the Book

How to Order

The 2012 Volume is just \$225.00

Return with your check to:

Tennessee Jury Verdict Reporter
9462 Brownsboro Road, No. 133
Louisville, KY 40241

_____ Name

_____ Address

Print Version _____

_____ City, State, Zip

PDF Version _____ (E-Mail Required)

Your E-Mail _____

We accept MasterCard/Visa. Call 1-866-228-2447 to place your credit card order.

Have you tried a case lately? We are traveling all over the state and communicating with court personnel, but if we know about a verdict, we'll get on it right away

Let us know about it at the
Tennessee Jury Verdict Reporter

Case Style _____

Jurisdiction _____ Case Number _____

Trial Judge _____ Date Verdict _____

Verdict _____

For plaintiff _____ (Name, City, Firm)

For defense _____ (Name, City, Firm)

Fact Summary _____

Injury/Damages _____

Submitted by: _____

Return to the Tennessee Jury Verdict Reporter or use any other format to reach us with verdict news

Email to: info@juryverdicts.net

a pretext to mask retaliation. In this lawsuit she presented a single retaliation count, Complex Industries firing her for having reported the racial hostility. If Jones prevailed at trial, she sought both compensatory and punitive damages. Complex Industries defended as noted above and denied any retaliation.

The jury's verdict was for Jones on the retaliation count and she took \$60,213 in lost wages. The jury added \$42,000 more in other

"compensatory" damages. Finding that punitive damages were appropriate, the jury assessed a \$350,000 penalty. The verdict totaled \$450,213. When the record was reviewed no judgment had been entered.

The Tennessee Jury Verdict Reporter
9462 Brownsboro Road, No. 133
Louisville, Kentucky 40241
1-866-228-2447
Online at Juryverdicts.net

From Memphis to Bristol, Nashville to Chattanooga
Comprehensive and Timely Tennessee Jury Verdict Coverage

Ordering is Easy

The Tennessee Jury Verdict Reporter
The Most Current and Complete Summary of Tennessee Jury Verdicts

Order the TJVR 2012 Year in Review - Do you have your copy yet?

Call to Place your MasterCard/Visa/Amex Order - 1-866-228-2447

Return with your check to:

The Tennessee Jury Verdict Reporter
at the above address

Name

Firm Name

____ \$299.00 for a one year subscription to the
Tennessee Jury Verdict Reporter (12 issues)

____ \$225.00 to order the 2012 TJVR Year in Review

Address

____ Print Version

____ PDF Version

City, State, Zip

Your E-mail _____
(Required for PDF version)

The Eighth Edition is now shipping