IN THE FIFTH CIRCUIT COURT FOR DAVIDSON COUNTY, TENNESSEE 2014 OCT 13 PM 12: 03 STORY L. LAURENT, Parent and Next of Kin of RYDER L. LAURENT, Deceased, Plaintiff, v. CASE NO.: 10C3273 JURY DEMAND OLD HARDING PEDIATRIC ASSOCIATES, P.C.,

ORDER OF JUDGMENT

Defendant.

This cause came on to be heard before the Honorable Joe P. Binkley, Jr., Judge of the Fifth Circuit Court for Davidson County, Tennessee for a trial by jury commencing on September 22, 2014. A jury of twelve (12) good and lawful Davidson County citizens and two (2) alternates were selected. During the trial, one (1) of the alternates had to be excused. The other alternate remained to serve as needed.

The jury and alternates, having been duly sworn to well and truly try the issues joined, did proceed to hear the opening statements of counsel for the parties.

The plaintiff commenced her proof on Tuesday, September 23, 2014. The plaintiff concluded proof on Friday, September 26, 2014. At the close of the plaintiff's case-in-chief, the Defendant Old Harding Pediatric Associates, P.C. moved for a directed verdict and, due

to an expert witness on behalf of the defendant being ready to testify, all were in agreement that the argument on the motion for directed verdict would be reserved for a later time.

The defendant concluded its proof on Tuesday, September 30, 2014.

The plaintiff presented a brief rebuttal through the testimony of Story Laurent.

Argument was then had on the motion for directed verdict. The Court overruled the motion.

On Wednesday, October 1, 2014, the Court instructed the jury regarding the law applicable to this action. Closing arguments then were presented by counsel for the parties. The Court gave the jury the final instructions and the jury retired to consider its verdict. The alternate juror was selected and dismissed. Later in the evening, the jury advised the Court that it wished to break for the night and return the following morning.

On Thursday, October 2, 2014, the jury returned and continued deliberations. On the afternoon of October 2, 2014, through its presiding juror, the jury announced its verdict. The Court read the questions out loud, and the presiding the juror answered all of the questions.

The Verdict Form, signed by the jury foreperson, is attached hereto and incorporated herein by reference. After reading out loud the answers to each of the questions on the Verdict Form, including the damages section, the Court polled each juror and asked each juror if they agreed with each and every question, including the damages section. Each juror indicated their affirmation to every question and answer, including the damages section, as shown on the Verdict Form.

Copy.

The jury found Old Harding Pediatric Associates, P.C., through Dr. Christopher M. Patton, to be at fault and assigned five percent (5%) of fault to Old Harding Pediatric Associates, P.C. through Dr. Christopher M. Patton. The jury found Old Harding Pediatric Associates, P.C., through Dr. James E. Keffer to be at fault and assigned Old Harding Pediatric Associates, P.C. through Dr. James E. Keffer forty-five percent (45%) of the total fault to it.

The jury also found the nonparty Vanderbilt University Medical Center at fault through its physicians on June 5, 2009 and assigned twenty-five percent (25%) of the total fault to it for that day. Finally, the jury found the nonparty Vanderbilt University Medical Center, through its physicians on June 6, 2009, to be at fault and assigned twenty-five percent (25%) of the total fault to it for the actions on that day.

In respect to damages, the jury assessed damages as follows:

- A. The mental and physical suffering actually \$ 750,000.00 endured by Ryder Laurent between the injury and death:
- B. Pecuniary value of the life of Ryder Laurent \$4,250,000.00 as specified on pages 13 and 14 of the jury charge

TOTAL DAMAGES

\$5,000,000.00

It is ORDERED and ADJUDGED that the Plaintiff Story L. Laurent recover from the Defendant Old Harding Pediatric Associates, P.C. the amount of TWO MILLION FIVE HUNDRED THOUSAND (\$2,500,000.00) DOLLARS with post judgment interest as

provided by law and any costs allowed by the Court. This judgment reflects the fifty percentage (50%) of fault that was placed on the Defendant Old Harding Pediatric Associates, P.C. through its physicians Dr. Christopher M. Patton and Dr. James E. Keffer. Thus, Old Harding Pediatric Associates, P.C. is responsible for fifty percent (50%) of the FIVE MILLION AND NO/100 (\$5,000,000.00) DOLLARS verdict.

The Court costs are assessed against the Defendant Old Harding Pediatric Associates, P.C.

IT IS SO ORDERED.

ENTERED this _____ day of ______, 2014.

ZJOE P. BINKZEY, JR. CIRCUIT COURT JUDGE

APPROVED FOR ENTRY:

KINNARD CLAYTON & BEVERIDGE

 $\mathbf{R}_{\mathbf{W}}$

Daniel L. Clayton

#12600

127 Woodmont Boulevard Nashville, Tennessee 37205

(615) 297-1007

ATTORNEYS FOR PLAINTIFF

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I hereby certify that a true and exact copy of the foregoing document has been mailed, postage prepaid to:

Thomas A. Wiseman, III, Esq. WISEMAN ASHWORTH LAW GROUP, PLC 511 Union Street Suite 800 Nashville, Tennessee 37219-1743

Daniel L. Clayton



IN THE FIFTH CIRCUIT COURT FOR NASHVILLE PM 8: 52 DAVIDSON COUNTY, TENNESSEE

	in in its analysis of the second	ad R. Roomen, Clerk
STORY L. LAURENT, Parent, and) h	2 in
Next of Kin of RYDER L. LAURENT,	(D.C.
Deceased,)	
)	
Plaintiff,)	,
)	
v.) Case No. 100	
)	BIHOCI 13
OLD HARDING PEDIATRIC)	13 8
ASSOCIATES, P.C.)	
D. 4. 3)	
Defendant.)	MAR
VERD	OICT FORM	
We, the jury, unanimously answer the que	estions submitted by the	Court as follows:
1. Did Defendant Old Harding Pedia Patton violate the recognized standard of care and treatment of Ryder Laurent, and o	of acceptable profession	al practice in its
YES	NO	
2. Did Defendant Old Harding Pedia Keffer violate the recognized standard of care and treatment of Ryder Laurent, and d	f acceptable profession	al practice in its
YES	NO	
f you answered "No" to both Question 1	and Ouestion 2. STOP	sion the verdict

If you answered "No" to both Question 1 and Question 2, STOP, sign the verdice form, and notify the Court officer.

If you answered "Yes," to either Question 1 or Question 2, answer the remaining questions.

3.	Did Vanderbilt Medical Center the 2009 violate the recognized stands care and treatment of Ryder Laure	ard of acceptable prof	fession practice in its
	YES	NO	
4.	Did Vanderbilt Medical Center th 2009 violate the recognized stands care and treatment of Ryder Lauren	ard of acceptable prof	ession practice in its
	YES	NO	
5.	What percentage of fault, if any, do	you assign to each or	f the following:
Defendar	nt Old Harding Pediatric Associates t	hrough Dr. Chris Patt	on: 5% (0-100%)
Defendant Old Harding Pediatric Associates through Dr. James Keffer: 45% (0-100%)			
	lt Medical Center through its physic		•
	lt Medical Center through its physici		
•		ŕ	
TOT	AL:		100 % (100%)
6. Without considering the percentages of fault found in Question 5, what total amount of damages, if any, have been proven by a preponderance of the evidence:			
	e mental and physical suffering acti injury and death;	- ·	er Laurent between \$ <u>750,000</u>
	cuniary Value of the Life of Ryder in the Jury Charge.	Laurent as specified o	on pages 13 and 14
			\$ <u>4,250,000</u>
ТОТА	L DAMAGES:	:	\$ <u>4,250,000</u> \$ <u>5,000,000</u>

Oct. 2, 2014 Date Many Smyth o Presiding Juror