

# Kentucky Trial Court Review

The Most Current and Complete Summary of Kentucky Jury Verdicts

April 2008

Published in Louisville, Kentucky

12 K.T.C.R. 4

## Comprehensive Statewide Jury Verdict Coverage

### Civil Jury Verdicts

Complete and timely coverage of civil jury verdicts including circuit, division, presiding judge, parties, case number, attorneys and results.

### **Car Repair Negligence - Just days after picking up a car from a major engine repair, the vehicle caught on fire and its owner was engulfed in flames while pulled from the burning wreckage, he died three days later**

*Mulligan v. Don s Auto Clinic*, 06-3827

Plaintiff: H. Philip Grossman,  
*Grossman & Moore*, Louisville

Defense: John R. Martin, Jr., *Landrum & Shouse*, Lexington

Verdict: \$3,255,899 for plaintiff

Circuit: **Jefferson**, J. McDonald,  
3-16-08

Bernard Mulligan, age 67 and a butcher at a Portland grocery, was having trouble with his 1995 Buick Riviera. The car kept overheating. It was repaired in September of 2004 by Don s Auto Clinic the repair shop is operated by Samuel Barrett.

Despite this first repair, the problems persisted. Mulligan returned the car to Don s Auto Clinic in mid-October. On this second repair, the repair shop concluded that wire insulation had melted. It recommended the engine be replaced with a rebuilt one. Mulligan consented and the work was done. He picked up his repaired Riviera on 11-4-04.

Just two days later, Mulligan was driving on the Greenbelt Highway. It is not exactly clear what happened next. What is known is that Mulligan pulled to the side of the road and the Riviera caught fire. As it became engulfed in flames and for unknown reasons, Mulligan was unable to exit. [This may have been from carbon monoxide or from Mulligan s diabetic condition.] A passerby pulled him from the fire.

Mulligan sustained catastrophic burns to 45% of his body, including to his head, face, neck, chest, hands, legs and airway. As he was taken by EMS to the hospital, Mulligan was conscious and

able to respond to commands. However he did not receive any pain medication until he arrived at the hospital this window of excruciating pain was estimated at 60 minutes. Thereafter Mulligan was medicated for his pain, but his wounds proved fatal. He died three days later.

His estate sued Don s Auto Clinic and alleged a negligent repair of the Riviera caused the fire. An expert in fire origin, William Haggerty, Escondido, CA, linked the fire to fluid that leaked onto the manifold. It was Haggerty s opinion that the vehicle was not properly repaired and inspected. If the estate prevailed, it sought past medicals, the funeral bill, destruction and pain and suffering.

Don s Auto Clinic defended the case and relied on Van Kirk, Mechanic, Lexington. Kirk concluded the fire started in the cooling system and importantly, on the other side of the vehicle from where the engine repair was made. Thus it was unrelated to the work done on the car by the repair shop. Plaintiff s own care in failing to exit the vehicle was also raised.

A Louisville jury resolved fault for Mulligan, finding Don s Auto Clinic solely to blame. Then to damages, the estate took medicals of \$102,019, plus the funeral expense of \$3,880. Destruction was \$150,000, the jury adding \$3,000,000 for pain and suffering. The raw verdict totaled \$3,225,899.

### **Police Negligence - In a devastating crash, a deputy sheriff (traveling at nearly 100 mph) crashed into a family of four the mother and daughter were killed, while the husband and son survived with serious injuries**

*Rose v. McCreary County Sheriff*,  
04-0230

Plaintiff: Tim Lavender, *Hatfield & Lavender*, Whitley City and William G. Crabtree, *Crabtree & Goforth*, London  
Defense: Winter R. Huff, *Law Offices of John Prather*, Somerset

Verdict: \$5,136,690 total for Rose Family less 30% comparative fault and assessed individually as follows:

\$3,432,851 for Charles; \$1,627,031 for Axl; \$68,573 for Estate of Alice; \$8,235 for Estate of Ashley

Circuit: **McCreary**, J. Braden and  
J. Gary Payne, 3-4-07

It was just after eleven in the evening on 8-21-03. Jeremy Thompson, a deputy sheriff for McCreary County, was responding to a call. Just on duty, he heard the dispatch of a depressed and suicidal woman that had a gun. The dispatch also indicated that the state police and EMS were on the scene.

Thompson headed for the scene in his 1996 Crown Victoria cruiser. He did so at high speed it was estimated at between 90 and 115 mph. Whatever the actual speed, he was going very fast in the area that was controlled by a 45 mph speed limit. He recalled his strobe light was on and his siren blaring. As Thompson headed to the scene, dispatch provided a Signal 8" indicating the situation had been handled by KSP Thompson acknowledged the signal.

At the same time, the Rose family of Whitley City was pulling from a grocery after having stopped for a drink. Alice Rose, age 28, was driving the family Hyundai. Her husband, Charles, age 33, was in the front seat. Their children, little Ashley (10) and Axl (9) were in the backseat. None were wearing seat belts.

Alice came to U.S. 27 near Williamsburg Street and saw nothing. She made a left turn. Alice did so just as Thompson was passing in his speeding

**Kentucky Trial Court Review**  
**April 2008**  
**Table of Contents**

**Verdicts**

**Jefferson County**

- Car Repair Negligence - *After an engine repair, plaintiff's car was engulfed in flames and the plaintiff was killed* - \$3,255,899 p. 1  
Underinsured Motorist - *The plaintiff complained of a shoulder injury after a rear-end wreck* - \$60,766 p. 4  
Bad Faith - *In a first-party UM case, an insurer was criticized for valuing a case at \$10,000 and instead only offering \$3,000 to settle the matter* - \$232,547 p. 5  
Disability Discrimination - *The day after the plaintiff was hospitalized (she was the manager of a medical office), she was fired* - Zero p. 6  
Auto Negligence - *Did a pedestrian have a green or instead did he dart into the defendant's path* - Zero p. 8  
Taxi Negligence - *In a sideswipe case, the claim of two plaintiffs was defeated by the threshold* - Threshold p. 8  
Auto Negligence - *Medicals/No Suffering* - \$1,461 p. 10

**McCreary County**

- Police Negligence - *Two family members were killed and two others badly hurt when a speeding deputy sheriff crashed into their vehicle* - \$5,136,690 p. 1

**Pulaski County**

- Bad Faith - *Renters of a U-Haul thought they had promise with an insurance policy that covered everything it actually excluded theft losses and when the trailer was stolen, the insurer balked at paying the claim* - \$1,790,000 p. 3

**Fayette County**

- Medical Negligence - *A medical group was criticized for not returning a call to a post-heart operation patient with DVT the day after taking the call, the man died* - \$814,225 p. 4  
Medical Negligence - *A forgotten sponge was linked to assorted complications, but most significantly, the plaintiff alleged it led to the premature birth of her infant son* - Zero p. 7  
Premises Liability - *A tenant fell on an exterior staircase on a slippery green mold* - \$3,000 p. 10

**Barren County**

- Medical Negligence - *During a laparoscopic gallbladder surgery, the defendant injured the plaintiff's bile duct* - Zero p. 5

**Federal Court - Louisville**

- Defamation - *A contract delivery driver for UPS alleged he was defamed by an allegation that he stole a set of golf clubs instead of delivering them to a sporting goods store* - For plaintiff p. 5

**Franklin County**

- Auto Negligence - *In a serious car wreck where the plaintiff sustained several fractures, the key proof focused on whether she had a permanent brain injury* - \$89,609 p. 6

**Jessamine County**

- Auto Negligence/UIM - *In this UIM case, not only was the carrier identified so too were the limits of coverage* - \$50,000 p. 7

**Daviess County**

- Medical Negligence - *A little girl died of a cardiac infection while in the hospital her estate blamed her pediatrician for not transferring her to a skilled children's hospital* - Zero p. 8

**McCracken County**

- Medical Negligence - *The prescription of birth control pills was linked to a disabling stroke* - Zero p. 9

**Lyon County**

- Employment Retaliation - *Within hours of reporting an adverse medical test (subsequent to a work-related injury), the plaintiff was terminated* - Zero p. 9

**Supreme Court Tort Opinions**

- Consumer Protection - *In the sale of a car when a used car dealer engaged in fraud, but the deal was never fully consummated, the plaintiffs are still purchasers within the meaning of the Consumer Protection Act* p. 10  
Release and Waiver - *As long as the release is valid and enforceable, a plaintiff may waive a right to bring a claim, whether statutory or otherwise* p. 11  
**Discretionary Review at the Supreme Court** p. 11

**Have you ordered your copy yet?**

**The KTCR 2007 Year in Review**

is back with its **tenth edition.**

The 2007 volume summarizes a remarkable ten years worth of data in all sorts of cases. If you're settling tort cases without *The Book*, you're just guessing.

**Read the Book and know what it's worth.**

**Order the KTCR 2007 Year in Review**  
Just \$225.00 plus tax (\$238.50 for KY residents)

*Call us toll-free at 1-877-313-1944 to pay by credit card or simply complete the order form on the backpage of this issue.*

**Now Available in Print Edition and PDF Format**