

# Federal Jury Verdict Reporter

The Most Current and Complete Summary of Federal Jury Verdicts

March 2006

Nationwide Federal Jury Verdict Coverage

2 FedJVR 3

## Notable Verdicts in The March 2006 Issue

- Bus Negligence** - *Mississippi Southern (Jackson)* - Plaintiff was badly hurt when a tandem of bus drivers attempted to switch drivers while the bus was still moving - \$9,000,000 p. 26
- Civil Rights** - *Arizona (Phoenix)* - The plaintiff was roughed up by Phoenix cops during a presidential visit - \$67,500 p. 8
- Defamation** - *South Carolina (Charleston)* - Six Green Berets alleged they were defamed by a fellow soldier's book that implicated them in an illegal war in Cambodia in 1965 and 1966 - Defense verdict p. 39
- Education Civil Rights** - *California Eastern (San Jose)* - An autistic seven-year old boy was abused by his special education teacher - \$700,000 p. 11
- Employment Retaliation** - *Tennessee Western (Jackson)* - A quality control employee for Pringles alleged he was fired for alleging race discrimination - \$2,529,000 p. 40
- First Amendment** - *California Eastern (San Jose)* - Circus protesters were removed from an arena parking lot by arena officials performing a Citizen's Arrest - \$4,800 p. 10
- Lanham Act** - *Utah (Salt Lake City)* - In a battle of home exercise equipment giants, it was alleged that Nautilus engaged in false advertising - \$7,846,617 p. 42
- Medical Negligence** - *Illinois Northern (Chicago)* - EMTs were slow to treat a woman suffering an allergic reaction to peanut oil and she suffered a fatal hypoxic event - \$1,000,000 p. 16
- Products Liability** - *Colorado (Denver)* - Plaintiff suffered a brain injury when the club head on a pitching wedge came loose and struck him in the head - \$2,106,619 p. 12
- Products Liability** - *Iowa Southern (Des Moines)* - A toddler engaged the gear shift on a Dodge truck - his grandfather was killed when he slipped while trying to stop the truck  
Defense verdict p. 19
- Products Liability** - *Massachusetts (Boston)* - Plaintiff crashed on her rollerblades and sustained multiple injuries - she blamed her crash on a brake defect - Defense verdict p. 25
- Products Liability** - *Michigan Eastern (Detroit)* - A man was burned when his radiator exploded - Defense verdict p. 25
- Race Discrimination** - *New Hampshire (Concord)* - An overweight black airline passenger alleged she was asked to buy two seats not because she was fat, but because of her race - Defense verdict p. 31
- Religious Discrimination** - *Ohio Northern (Akron)* - A Christian foundation that did state work discriminated against two workers for not being Christian enough - \$197,310 p. 34
- Sex Discrimination** - *Nevada (Reno)* - An older female casino employee was fired, management trying to turn the gaming pit into a bikini pit - Defense verdict p. 30
- Truck Negligence** - *Kentucky Eastern (Covington)* - A woman and her son were killed by a trucker that lost control and crossed the median on the interstate - \$8,706,279 p. 21
- TV Station Negligence** - *West Virginia Northern (Wheeling)* - Plaintiff walked into an open door of a news vans that was illegally parked - \$76,000 p. 43

## Verdict of the Month

### TRUCK LOADING NEGLIGENCE

*Connecticut District - Bridgeport*

**Plaintiff, a truck driver, was left a paraplegic when while unloading a commercial truck, the heavy freight fell upon him because of a purportedly defective liftgate**

**Caption:** *Pouliot v. Paul Arpin Van Lines, 3:02-1302*

**Plaintiff:** Michael A. Stratton and Michael L. Olt, *Stratton Faxon*, New Haven, CT and Roland F. Moots, Jr., *Moots Pellegrini Spillane & Mannion*, New Milford, CT

**Defense:** Harold J. Friedman and Karen Frink Wolf, *Friedman Gaythwaite Wolf & Leavitt*, Portland, ME

**Verdict:** \$26,306,376 for plaintiff

**Judge:** Janet C. Hall

**Date:** January 20, 2005

## New this Month The FedJVR Online

Beginning this month, the Federal Jury Verdict Reporter has begun to link directly to significant documents from certain cases. Whenever you see the heading, **The FedJVR Online**, look for the web link to the particular document.

As we roll out this feature in the next several months, we hope to include more and more links to important documents, including significant orders, opinions, motions and jury instructions.

## Federal Jury Verdict Reporter March 2006 Table of Contents

### Age Discrimination

- Johnson v. Bailey Oldsmobile - Georgia Northern - Zero*  
A sales manager was fired because of his age p. 15
- Gross v. Farm Bureau - Iowa Southern - \$46,241*  
Claims executive alleged he was forced out p. 19
- Blackwell v. DaimlerChrysler - Missouri Eastern - Zero*  
A long-time assembly worker was fired p. 27
- Schwanker v. Frank Winne - Pennsylvania Eastern - \$525,000*  
An elderly salesman was fired p. 35

### Auto Negligence

- Robinson v. Brewer - Arkansas Eastern - \$1,150*  
Three women injured in a car wreck p. 10
- Knupfer v. Crassmeyer - Pennsylvania Middle - \$19,653*  
Right of way crash – soft-tissue injury p. 36

### Bad Faith

- Maule v. GEICO - Alaska - \$57,500*  
Handling of a UM claim p. 7

### Bailment

- Holway v. Negro Leagues - Missouri Western - Zero*  
The Negro Leagues Museum lost a priceless collection of audio recordings p. 28

### Breach of Contract

- Jones v. Cosmetique - Connecticut - \$2,900,000*  
Unpaid cosmetic commissions sought p. 13
- Strauss Farms v. Burlison Gin - Kansas - \$150,000*  
Cattle feed spontaneously combusted p. 20
- Pro Soft v. Logan Aluminum - Kentucky Western - \$2,169,988*  
Dispute over automated controls at an aluminum mill p. 21
- Bohne v. Computer Associates - Massachusetts - \$86,689*  
A pro se salesman wanted his commissions p. 24
- Honey Dew Donuts v. Carniero - Massachusetts - \$11,945*  
Breach of a donut franchise agreement p. 24

### Breach of Warranty

- Pixel v. Monaco Coach - Indiana Northern - \$90,000*  
An RV turned out to be a lemon p. 17
- Peters v. AM General - Michigan Eastern - Zero*  
Plaintiff his Hummer (H1) was a lemon p. 25

### Bus Negligence

- Martinez v. Tres Amigos Tours - Mississippi Southern - \$9,000,000*  
Plaintiff was badly hurt when bus drivers switched at the wheel while the bus was still moving p. 26

### Civil Rights

- Riley v. Tuscaloosa County - Alabama Northern - Zero*  
Denied medications in jail p. 7
- Burnett v. Public Safety - Arizona - \$67,500*  
Presidential protester roughed up in Phoenix p. 8
- Levadas v. D.C. - District of Columbia - Zero*  
Plaintiff was assaulted by a D.C. cop p. 14
- Olszewski v. Baltimore Police - Maryland - \$1,600*  
In a case of mistaken identity, the police thought a jogger was a fleeing suspect p. 23
- Jones v. Stoneking - Minnesota - \$160,000*  
A drunk was raped by a deputy sheriff p. 26
- McHenry v. Delaware County - Pennsylvania Eastern - \$16,000*  
In a case of mistaken identity, a father was falsely arrested on Father's Day for being a deadbeat dad p. 36

### Defamation

- Tuttle v. Trine Day Press - South Carolina - Zero*  
Green Berets alleged they were defamed by a book that implicated them in an illegal war in Cambodia p. 39

### Disability Discrimination

- Jacobs v. USPS - Alabama Middle - Zero*  
Letter carrier kept off work after a knee injury p. 7
- Haneke v. Mid-Atlantic Capital - Maryland - \$525,000*  
When a plaintiff asked for time off because her kidneys were failing, she was fired p. 23
- Head v. Glacier Northwest - Oregon - \$160,000*  
A bipolar employee was fired when he got a loader stuck in the mud p. 35

### Education Civil Rights

- Gaydos v. Cupertino School - California Eastern - \$700,000*  
An autistic boy was abused by his teacher p. 11
- Allen v. Parkland School - Pennsylvania Eastern - Zero*  
A wrestler was choked by another wrestler on orders from the coach as punishment for smoking p. 36

### Employment Retaliation

- Nogales v. Santa Ana School - California Central - Zero*  
A principal alleged she was fired for supporting an embattled trustee who was later recalled p. 11
- Jackson v. Metropolitan State College - Colorado - \$300,000*  
Professor suffered adverse action when he complained of race discrimination p. 12
- Finney v. Bibb County Schools - Georgia Middle - Zero*  
Custodian fired for opposing sexual harassment p. 15
- Mondaine v. Osco's Drug - Kansas - Zero*  
In a wide-ranging complaint, plaintiff alleged retaliation for a combination of race and disability complaints p. 20
- Scanlon v. Honeywell - Pennsylvania Western - Zero*  
A salesman was fired after he called an Ethics Hotline to report a racially insensitive remark by his boss p. 37
- Lewis v. Sheridan Broadcasting - Pennsylvania Western - Zero*  
A white broadcaster at a mostly black radio network was fired when she complained of race inequity p. 37
- Long v. Proctor & Gamble - Tennessee Western - \$2,529,000*  
A Pringles chip maker was fired purportedly because he alleged race discrimination p. 40
- DePaoli v. Vacation Sales - Virginia Western - \$7,700,000*  
A successful time share salesman was fired after complaining that she was not promoted p. 42

### Equal Pay Act

- Martinelli v. Penn Millers Ins - Pennsylvania Middle - Zero*  
An underwriter alleged she was paid less than a male comparator p. 38

### Excessive Force

- Villalta v. Omaha Police - Nebraska - Zero*  
Plaintiff was roughed up in a grocery p. 29

### Fair Debt Collections Practices Act

- French v. Corporate Receivables - Massachusetts - \$1,000*  
A collector lied and said he was a lawyer p. 24

### Fair Labor Standards Act

- Pierce v. Coleman Trucking - Ohio Northern - Zero*  
Asbestos workers weren't paid for the time it took to put on their protective equipment p. 33

**FELA**

*Okorski v. CSX - Ohio Southern* - \$178,000  
A worker with a golf-cart snowplow was injured when the snowplow struck an elevated steel plate p. 33

**First Amendment**

*Cuviello v. HP Management - California Eastern* - \$4,800  
Two circus protesters were arrested in a parking lot p. 10

**Fraud**

*Production Specialities v. Minsor - Wisconsin Eastern* - \$766,477  
Fraud in the procurement of a commercial contract p. 43

**Gender Discrimination**

*Diehm v. Omaha - Nebraska* - Zero  
A police recruit was kicked out of the academy purportedly because of her gender p. 30

*Berge v. Harrah's - Nevada* - Zero  
An older worker was fired from a casino job, the company attempting to develop a bikini pit p. 30

*Russell v. UTPB - Texas Western* - Zero  
An English professor claimed she was denied tenure because of her gender p. 41

**Industrial Negligence**

*Mesman v. Crane Pro - Indiana Northern* - Zero  
Steelworker hurt when steel fell from a crane p. 17

**Insurance Contract**

*Achey v. State Farm - Indiana Northern* - Zero  
Did the plaintiffs burn down their home? p. 18

**Lanham Act**

*Icon Health v. Nautilus - Utah* - \$7,846,617  
False advertising regarding the Bowflex p. 42

**Legal Negligence**

*Balzer v. Shaw Pittman - New Jersey* - Zero  
A radio executive thought her employment contract was botched by a D.C. labor lawyer p. 31

**Loading Dock Negligence**

*Satterfield v. USA Truck - Maine* - \$753,541  
A truck's brake wasn't set and a worker in a forklift inside the truck was hurt when the truck rolled away p. 22

**Marine Indemnity**

*Cal Dive v. Broco - Louisiana Eastern* - Fault only  
A marine employer sought identity for sums paid to its diver after a underwater torch exploded p. 22

**Medical Negligence**

*Johnson v. Lake in the Hills et al - Illinois Northern* - \$1,000,000  
Treatment of a woman in an allergic shock p. 16

*Schmidt v. Ahlawat - Illinois Northern* - Zero  
A drug addict got prescription drugs from an internet doctor who never examined him p. 16

*Keirsey v. Barnes - Missouri Eastern* - \$100,000  
An hip replacement gone bad p. 28

*Jones v. Buchanan - Oklahoma Western* - Zero  
A neophyte doctor botched a carpal tunnel surgery p. 34

**Negligent Security**

*Freeman v. Purple Crackle - Missouri Eastern* - Zero  
Plaintiff was shot in a bar p. 28

**Outrage**

*Gebremedin v. Whole Food Markets - North Carolina Eastern* - Zero  
A kitchen worker at a grocery alleged her boss threatened to cut out her unborn baby with a knife p. 32

**Patent Infringement**

*Texas Instruments v. Globespan - New Jersey* - \$112,000,000  
Infringement of ASDL technology p. 32

*Cedarrapids v. Johnson Crushers - Tennessee Eastern* - Zero  
Dispute over gyratory cone crusher patents p. 40

**Premises Liability**

*Leffall v. Kroger - Texas Eastern* - Zero  
Plaintiff fell over a landscape timber p. 41

**Products Liability**

*Price v. Wilson Sporting Goods - Colorado* - \$2,106,619  
Injury sustained when golf shaft broke p. 12

*Ahlberg v. DaimlerChrysler - Iowa Southern* - Zero  
Plaintiff was run over after a car was shifted into gear by a toddler – the estate criticized the lack of a brake-lock p. 19

*Cariffo v. Bennetton - Massachusetts* - Zero  
The brakes on plaintiff's rollerblades failed p. 25

*Croskery v. BMW - Michigan Eastern* - Zero  
The radiator on plaintiff's BMW exploded p. 25

*Howard v. Ford - Mississippi Northern* - Zero  
Plaintiff was killed in an Explorer roll-over p. 27

*Olson v. Ford Motor Company - North Dakota* - Zero  
Plaintiff was killed when the accelerator on his Explorer stuck and he ran off the road into a tree p. 33

*Heard v. National Crane - South Carolina* - Zero  
Plaintiff was struck in the head by the jib on a crane that had been improperly loaded p. 39

**Race Discrimination**

*Burkette v. Hardee's - Alabama Middle* - Zero  
Restaurant manager fired because of her race p. 8

*Norris v. Jefferson Rehabilitation - Alabama Northern* - Zero  
Probationary social worker alleged discrimination p. 8

*Adakai v. Salt River Project - Arizona* - Zero  
Native American chemist alleged discrimination p. 9

*Race Discrimination - District of Columbia* - Zero  
Civilian lawyer alleged race discrimination p. 14

*Thompson v. Southwest Airlines - New Hampshire* - Zero  
An overweight air passenger was asked to buy two tickets and she believed it was a race-based decision p. 31

**Religious Discrimination**

*Carter v. Diamondback Golf - Florida Middle* - Zero  
A Jehovah's Witness golf course employee alleged discrimination in the workplace p. 14

*Gibbons v. The Bair Foundation - Ohio Northern* - \$197,310  
Plaintiffs suffered discrimination at a Christian foundation for being the wrong kind of Christian p. 34

**School Negligence**

*Teasley v. Mountain Park Boarding - Missouri Eastern* - Zero  
Teen girls at a Baptist boarding school alleged they were secretly drugged so that they could be managed p. 29

**Sexual Harassment**

*Guerin v. City of Phoenix - Arizona* - \$1,225,002  
Water district employed alleged she was exposed to chronic sexual harassment p. 9

*Lopez v. Aramak Uniform - Iowa Northern* - \$608,000  
Two laundry workers alleged they were victimized by their boss who preyed on their vulnerability p. 20

*McNally v. Methodist Healthcare - Tennessee Western* - \$125,000  
A hospital worker was persistently harassed by a co-worker and nothing was done to correct it p. 41

**Truck Loading Negligence**

*Pouliot v. Arpin Van Lines - Connecticut - \$26,306,376*

Plaintiff left a paraplegic after a heavy load fell upon him  
because of broken lift gate p. 13

**Truck Negligence**

*Embry v. Geo Transportation - Kentucky Eastern - \$8,706,279*

A mother and her infant son were killed by an out of control  
trucker p. 21

**TV Station Negligence**

*Sampson v. WTOV-TV - West Virginia Northern - \$76,000*

Plaintiff walked into an open door on a TV news van, the  
van being parked illegally p. 43

**Uninsured Motorist**

*Maule v. GEICO - Alaska - \$57,500*

Right of way car crash p. 7

---

## Index by State

**Alabama**

Civil Rights - Zero p. 7  
 Disability Discrimination - Zero p. 7  
 Race Discrimination - Zero p. 8  
 Race Discrimination - Zero p.8

**Alaska**

Uninsured Motorist/Bad Faith - \$57,500 p. 7

**Arizona**

Civil Rights - \$67,500 p. 8  
 Race Discrimination - Zero p. 9  
 Sexual Harassment - \$1,225,002 p. 9

**Arkansas**

Auto Negligence - \$1,150 p. 10

**California**

First Amendment - \$4,800 p. 10  
 Education Civil Rights - \$700,000 p. 11  
 Employment Retaliation - Zero p. 11

**Colorado**

Employment Retaliation - \$300,000 p. 12  
 Products Liability - \$2,106,619 p. 12

**Connecticut**

Breach of Contract - \$2,900,000 p. 13  
 Truck Loading Negligence - \$26,306,376 p. 13

**District of Columbia**

Civil Rights - Defense verdict p. 14  
 Race Discrimination - Defense verdict p. 14

**Florida**

Religious Discrimination - Defense verdict p. 14

**Georgia**

Age Discrimination - Defense verdict p. 15  
 Employment Retaliation - Defense verdict p. 15

**Illinois**

Medical Negligence - \$1,000,000 p. 16  
 Medical Negligence - Defense verdict p. 16

**Indiana**

Breach of Warranty - \$90,000 p. 17  
 Industrial Negligence - Defense verdict p. 17  
 Insurance Contract - Defense verdict p. 18

**Iowa**

Age Discrimination - \$46,241 p. 19  
 Products Liability - Defense verdict p. 19  
 Sexual Harassment - \$608,000 p. 20

**Kansas**

Breach of Contract - \$150,000 p. 20  
 Employment Retaliation - Defense verdict p. 20

**Kentucky**

Breach of Contract - \$2,169,988 p. 21  
 Truck Negligence - \$8,706,279 p. 21

**Louisiana**

Marine Indemnity - Mixed verdict on fault p. 22

**Maine**

Loading Dock Negligence - \$753,541 p. 22

**Maryland**

Civil Rights - \$1,600 p. 23  
 Disability Discrimination - \$525,000 p. 23

**Massachusetts**

Breach of Employment Contract - \$86,689 p. 24  
 Breach of Franchise Agreement - \$11,945 p. 24

Fair Debt Collections Practice Act - \$1,000 p. 24  
 Products Liability - Defense verdict p. 25

**Michigan**

Breach of Warranty - Defense verdict p. 25  
 Products Liability - Defense verdict p. 25

**Minnesota**

Civil Rights - \$160,000 p. 26

**Mississippi**

Bus Negligence - \$9,000,000 p. 26  
 Products Liability - Defense verdict p. 27

**Missouri**

Age Discrimination - Defense verdict p. 27  
 Bailment - Defense verdict p. 28  
 Medical Negligence - \$100,000 p. 28  
 Negligent Security - Defense verdict p. 28  
 School Negligence - Defense verdict p. 29

**Nebraska**

Excessive Force - Defense verdict p. 29  
 Gender Discrimination - Defense verdict p. 30

**Nevada**

Sex/Age Discrimination - Defense verdict p. 30

**New Hampshire**

Race Discrimination - Defense verdict p. 31

**New Jersey**

Legal Negligence - Defense verdict p. 31  
 Patent Infringement - \$112,000,000 p. 32

**North Carolina**

Outrage - Defense verdict p. 32

**North Dakota**

Products Liability - Defense verdict p. 33

**Ohio**

Fair Labor Standards Act - Defense verdict p. 33  
 FELA - \$170,000 p. 33  
 Religious Discrimination - \$197,310 p. 34

**Oklahoma**

Medical Negligence - Defense verdict p. 34

**Oregon**

Disability Discrimination - \$160,000 p. 35

**Pennsylvania**

Age Discrimination - \$509,274 p. 35  
 Auto Negligence - \$19,653 p. 36  
 Civil Rights - \$16,000 p. 36  
 Education Civil Rights - Defense verdict p. 36  
 Employment Retaliation - Defense verdict p. 37  
 Employment Retaliation - Defense verdict p. 37  
 Equal Pay/Retaliation - Defense verdict p. 38  
 Medical Negligence - For plaintiff p. 38

**South Carolina**

Defamation - Defense verdict p. 39  
 Products Liability - Defense verdict p. 39

**Tennessee**

Employment Retaliation - \$2,529,000 p. 40  
 Patent Infringement - Defense verdict p. 40  
 Products Liability - Defense verdict p. 40  
 Sexual Harassment - \$125,000 p. 41

**Texas**

Gender Discrimination - Defense verdict p. 41  
 Premises Liability - Defense verdict p. 41

---

**Utah**

Lanham Act - \$7,846,617 p. 42

**Virginia**

Employment Retaliation - \$7,700,000 p. 42

**West Virginia**

TV Station Negligence - \$76,000 p. 43

**Wisconsin**

Fraud - \$766,477 p. 43

---

**Uninsured Motorist/Bad Faith - An insurer was implicated not just for a UM count, but also for bad faith in forcing the plaintiff to litigate the claim**

*Maule v. GEICO*, 3:03-183

**Plaintiff:** Jeffrey J. Barber, *Law Office of Steve Sims*, Anchorage, AK

**Defense:** Rebecca J. Hozubin, *Wilkerson Hozubin & Burke*, Anchorage, AK

**Verdict:** \$50,000 for plaintiff on UIM claim  
\$7,500 on bad faith

**Court:** Alaska - Anchorage

**Judge:** John W. Sedwick

**Date:** 2-8-06

Teresa Maule was involved in a fender-bender on 8-20-01 – her vehicle was hit by an uninsured driver. From the scene, Maule then eight months pregnant, was taken to the ER. She was kept overnight for observation. A week later she delivered a healthy baby. Maule has continued to complain of soft-tissue whiplash symptoms.

Her insurer, GEICO, paid \$10,000 of her medicals, also tendering another \$20,000 for unspecified damages. While the policy limits were \$50,000, GEICO would pay no more. It believed Maule had been fully and fairly compensated.

Maule disagreed and in this federal lawsuit, she sought both the extent of the UIM coverage, plus damages for purported bad faith by GEICO. That is instead of paying her claim, GEICO forced her to litigate. GEICO defended as above that the \$30,000 received was all it owed.

Maule prevailed on the UM count and took medicals of \$30,000, plus \$20,000 more for non-economic damages. The UM portion of the verdict totaled \$50,000 – a judgment less the underlying \$30,000 was entered for her.

She also prevailed on the breach of implied promise of good faith and fair dealing count – damages of \$7,500. This Alaska jury further rejected that GEICO's conduct was outrageous, thus exonerating it from an award of punitives. A consistent judgment reflected the verdict.

**Disability Discrimination - A long-time letter carrier was fired after suffering an on-the-job injury that prevented him from delivering the mail – in this suit, the plaintiff alleged the USPS failed to accommodate him by providing a clerical position**

*Jacobs v. USPS*, 2:99-1357

**Plaintiff:** Arlene M. Richardson, *Richardson Legal Center*, Hayneville, AL

**Defense:** R. Randolph Neeley, *Assistant U.S. Attorney*, Montgomery, AL and Kathie Lynn Janowicz, *USPS*, Memphis, TN

**Verdict:** Defense verdict on liability

**Court:** Alabama Middle - Montgomery

**Judge:** Myron H. Thompson

**Date:** 1-12-06

Tommy Jacobs started working in 1973 as a letter carrier for the USPS. In 1997 and while at work, he aggravated a pre-existing disc injury. The effect of this injury was to restrict him to light duty. He could no longer deliver the mail.

Initially the USPS found a clerical spot for Jacobs. However in 1998, it concluded that as he could not perform the essential functions of being a letter carrier – Jacobs was given two choices, (1) take disability or (2) be fired. He took the disability. The USPS explained its decision as there were no

open spots at his pay grade in Montgomery.

Jacobs believed the firing represented disability discrimination in violation of the Rehabilitation Act. Particularly, he cited that the USPS could reasonably accommodate his disability, noting that for a time, he was placed in a clerical position. [At all times, he argued, vacant spots were open.] If prevailing, he sought both back pay and non-pecuniary damages. The USPS defended as above.

The plaintiff's Rehabilitation Act claim was rejected in Montgomery and there was no award of damages.

**Civil Rights - Awaiting sentencing on a felony DUI conviction, the plaintiff alleged a jail deputy was indifferent to his request for medications – he later suffered seizures**

*Riley v. Tuscaloosa County Sheriff*, 7:02-1821

**Plaintiff:** David Gespass, *Gespass & Johnson*, Birmingham, AL

**Defense:** Dennis Steverson, Tuscaloosa, AL

**Verdict:** Defense verdict on liability

**Court:** Alabama Northern - Tuscaloosa

**Judge:** U.W. Clemon

**Date:** 2-1-06

In November of 2000, Freddie Riley was an inmate at the Tuscaloosa County Jail – he was awaiting sentencing on a felony DUI conviction. To treat a seizure condition, Riley had a prescription for phenobarbital.

On 11-23-00, Riley asked for his medications. The jail supervisor, a deputy sheriff, Annette Wolff, told Riley she couldn't find his medications. She also refused to let him see a doctor.

Thereafter Riley suffered several seizures – Wolff still wouldn't transport him to a hospital, believing he was faking.

Because of Wolff's failure to act, Riley alleged he suffered two insults, (1) that he had seizures at all because his medication was denied, and (2) Wolff left him in a holding cell. This conduct formed the basis of a federal 8<sup>th</sup> Amendment claim. Wolff defended the case that when Riley showed signs of seizure, he was removed from the general population and taken to a holding cell. While there he was observed with no apparent sign of injury. Thus rather than the being indifferent to his medical needs, she responded and monitored an apparently minor condition.

This case was resolved by a federal jury in Tuscaloosa for the county – it rejected Riley's 8<sup>th</sup> Amendment claim and awarded no damages. A defense judgment followed. [Riley appeared at trial, having been transferred from a federal prison, apparently related to a different set of criminal charges.]

**Race Discrimination - A black fast-food restaurant manager alleged she was let go because of her race – she cited remarks by restaurant bigwigs that it wanted to “whiten up” its work force**

*Burkette v. Hardee’s*, 2:02-403

**Plaintiff:** Gregory O. Wiggins and Kevin W. Jent, *Wiggins Childs Quinn & Pantazis*, Birmingham, AL

**Defense:** Robert S. Lamar, Jr. and Stephen D. Christie, *Lamar Miller Norris Haggard & Christie*, Birmingham, AL

**Verdict:** Defense verdict on liability

**Court:** Alabama Middle - Montgomery

**Judge:** Myron H. Thompson

**Date:** 1-19-06

Linda Burkette, who is black, started working in 1978 for a Hardee’s franchise conglomerate in Montgomery. By 2000, she was a general manager, operating the Lower Wetumpka store. She did well in her job. In that year, the franchises were sold to a new owner.

Soon after, Burkette noticed another black manager was fired – Burkette was advised she was next on the list. She also cited proof that the company had a focus on having a store’s racial makeup match that of the neighborhood where it was located. Even more insidious, Burkette recalled being told that Hardee’s wanted to “whiten up” its workforce.

It was her belief the company did just that when it fired her in February of 2001. Thereafter she was immediately replaced by a white manager. Burkette took the position her firing was orchestrated in advance, her replacement being selected even before she was let go.

Hardee’s denied race had anything to do with its decision. It noted more facts from February of 2001, beginning with a negative job evaluation – Burkette was so upset by this that she went on a medical leave. Then when released to work, she failed to respond to a call from her manager. Only then was she fired. As noted above, Burkette thought the explanation for the firing was phony, it having been concocted by Hardee’s to mask its illegal motive.

The long journey to a jury trial was interrupted – the trial court first granted summary judgment for Hardee’s. Burkette appealed. The 11<sup>th</sup> Circuit reversed in a per curiam opinion, concluding Burkette had proven her prima facie case.

Back to trial, a first jury could not reach a verdict in August of 2005. Tried again, the verdict was for Hardee’s that Burkette’s race was not a substantial and motivating factor in the decision to fire her. That ended the deliberations and Burkette took nothing.

She has since moved for a new trial. She argued it was unfair to excuse the jury panel’s only black juror (for personal reasons) and then not similarly exclude a white juror. Judge Thompson denied the motion, noting the black juror was a doctor whose practice would have been significantly inconvenienced by a trial delay. Then to the decision denying the motion, the court wrote that the juror was dismissed because of happenstance, race not having anything to do with it. When the record was reviewed, the time for a second appeal had not yet run.

**The FedJVR Online:**

See <http://www.juryverdicts.net/AL-Burkette.pdf>

for the court’s opinion denying the motion for a new trial.

**Race Discrimination - A probationary social worker alleged she was fired because of her race, citing a similarly situated white employee who was not sacked**

*Norris v. Jefferson Rehabilitation & Health Center*, 2:04-3232

**Plaintiff:** Gregory O. Wiggins and Kevin W. Jent, *Wiggins Childs Quinn & Pantazis*, Birmingham, AL

**Defense:** Charles S. Wagner and T.A. Lawson, II, *Assistant City Attorney*, Birmingham, AL

**Verdict:** Defense verdict on liability

**Court:** Alabama Northern - Birmingham

**Judge:** Inge P. Johnson

**Date:** 1-30-06

Mary Norris, who is black, was hired on 6-3-03 as a social worker for the Jefferson Rehabilitation and Health Center (JRHC). For the first twelve months of her employment, her job was considered probationary.

JRHC bigwigs believed her work was poor. A hearing was held on 5-13-04 (Norris was represented by counsel) and a decision was made to fire her. From the perspective of JRHC, it had everything to do with poor performance and the failure to improve.

Norris thought otherwise believing she was a victim of race discrimination. In this case, she posited a disparate treatment claim – she focused on a probationary white employee, who did poorly and was not fired. [Norris had no direct proof of discrimination.] JRHC denied race played a role in its decision, also diminishing the comparison to the alleged comparator.

The jury’s verdict was for JRHC on the disparate treatment race-based claim and Norris took nothing.

**Civil Rights - During the president’s visit to Phoenix, a protester was roughed up by the police – this is the second recent verdict involving Arizona law enforcement arising out of this same presidential visit**

*Burnett v. Department of Public Safety*, 2:03-1891

**Plaintiff:** Stephen G. Montoya, *Montoya Jimenez*, Phoenix, AZ

**Defense:** James B. Bowen, *Assistant Attorney General*, Phoenix, AZ

**Verdict:** \$67,500 for plaintiff against Holley; Defense verdict for Bottoms and Pinnow

**Court:** Arizona - Phoenix

**Judge:** Lawrence O. Anderson

**Date:** 1-17-06

9-27-02 was a big day in Phoenix, AZ. President George Bush made a downtown appearance at the Civic Plaza. His presence led to a combination of two combustible entities: (1) an overwhelming force of police, and (2) protesters.

One protester that day was Diane Burnett. While crossing the street in a crosswalk, she was ordered by a policeman, Robert Holley, to return to the other side of the street. She did so. Moments later, Holley saw Burnett engaged in a conversation with a mounted officer.

It appeared to Holley that Burnett had waved her protest sign in the horse’s face. He ordered her arrest, which was effectuated by John Bottoms and Jennifer Pinnow. The criminal case against Burnett did not hold up.

She turned the tables in this federal lawsuit and alleged false arrest against Holley, Bottoms and Pinnow. It was her position that at all times, she was engaged in lawful conduct. That included crossing the street in the crosswalk – then when she talked with the mounted officer, she didn’t attack the horse – rather she used the sign to defend herself. Holley countered as



above that probable cause existed to arrest, Burnett having spooked the horse. Bottoms and Pinnow further defended that they just followed Holley's arrest order.

The verdict was mixed at trial. Burnett prevailed against Holley on the false arrest count, but both Bottoms and Pinnow were exonerated. Then to damages, Burnett took compensatory damages of \$42,500, plus \$25,000 more in punitives. The verdict totaled \$67,500.

This is the second trial to result from this single presidential visit. As reported in 1 FedJVR 1 at page 8, the head of the Arizona ACLU was also arrested when she tried to cross the street. A defense verdict was returned – Bottoms was also a defendant in that case.

### **Race Discrimination - A Native American utility employee alleged he was treated differently and subjected to greater scrutiny than white co-workers**

*Adakai v. Salt River Project Power District*, 2:03-4

**Plaintiff:** Alona M. Gottfried, *Gillespie & Associates*, Phoenix, AZ and Tod F. Schleier, *Schleier Jellison & Schleier*, Phoenix, AZ

**Defense:** John J. Egbert, *Jennings Strouss & Salmon*, Phoenix, AZ

**Verdict:** Defense verdict on liability

**Court:** Arizona - Phoenix

**Judge:** Mary H. Murguia

**Date:** 2-10-06

Franklin Adakai started working in 1990 as a chemist for the Salt River Project Power District. During the course of his employment, Adakai, who is Native American, believed he was treated differently because of that status. That included a boss who allegedly said that Indians have a "you-owe-me attitude." Another remarked that plaintiff used his "Navaho-stuff" at work. Adakai repeatedly complained about it. [Salt River thought the complaints were repetitive, baseless and ultimately disruptive.]

His employment with Salt River ended on 7-24-01. The company explained its firing was because his chemical analysis was wrong. Adakai's disruptive attitude in filing complaint after complaint was also cited. Flatly the utility denied that Adakai's race or that retaliation played any role in its firing decision. Thus it was not the content of the complaints that bothered Salt River bigwigs, but rather their disruptive effect.

Adakai disagreed noting beyond the remarks above that he was subjected to closer scrutiny than white workers. It culminated with his ultimate firing – he noted in this regard that white workers with similar mistakes were not fired. Salt River defended as above and denied discrimination or retaliation.

The verdict was for Salt River on both the race and retaliation counts, Adakai taking nothing. A defense judgment followed.

### **SEXUAL HARASSMENT**

*Arizona District - Phoenix*

#### **A City of Phoenix water department employee was subjected to chronic sexual harassment – when she complained her boss did nothing**

**Caption:** *Ortega-Guerin v. City of Phoenix*,

**Plaintiff:** Stephen G. Montoya, *Montoya Jimenez*, Phoenix, AZ

**Defense:** David Gaona and Nicole Seder Cantelme, *Gaona Law Firm*, Phoenix, AZ

**Verdict:** \$1,225,002 for plaintiff

**Judge:** Mary H. Murguia

**Date:** December 22, 2006

**Facts:** Monica Ortega-Guerin was employed in 2002 by the City of Phoenix Water Department. She alleged in this lawsuit that a co-worker, Frank Peralta, subjected her to chronic verbal sexual harassment. When she complained to her boss, Frank Favela, nothing was done.

Because of the harassment, Ortega-Guerin suffered emotionally. Her hair fell out and she reported sleeplessness and depression. In this sexual harassment lawsuit, she sued both the city and the two individual actors.

The defendants denied any wrongdoing. At best, Peralta's conduct was described as non-sexual horseplay. While it may have been boorish, that did not rise to the level of a constitutional violation. Then when Ortega-Guerin complained, Favela's response was called reasonable.

**Jury Instructions/Verdict:** Ortega-Guerin prevailed on the harassment count against the city, Favela and Peralta. She took compensatory damages of \$850,002, assessed \$850,000 to the city and \$1.00 each to the individual defendants. She also took punitive damages – they were assessed \$350,000 and \$25,000, respectively, to Favela and Peralta. The verdict totaled \$1,225,002.

**Post-Trial Motions:** Pending is the city's motion for remittitur which has argued the verdict was excessive in light of plaintiff's complaints of emotional harm.

**Auto Negligence - Three plaintiffs complained of a soft-tissue injury after a rear-end crash – one took minimal damages, the claims of the other two being rejected on causation**

*Robinson et al v. Brewer*, 4:03-1017

**Plaintiff:** Lori A. Mosby, *The Mosby Law Firm*,  
Little Rock, AR

**Defense:** Jeffrey W. Puryear, *Womack Landis Phelps McNeill & McDaniel*, Jonesboro, AR

**Verdict:** \$1,150 for Robinson; Defense verdict on damages for Krystal and Catrina

**Court:** Arkansas Eastern - Little Rock

**Judge:** Rodney S. Webb

**Date:** 11-18-05

Three plaintiffs were injured in a 9-8-03 car wreck on I-30 in Arkansas. In a construction zone, Luckie Brewer crashed into a vehicle containing Rosetta Robinson, Krystal Williams and Catrina Williams. Fault was no issue. All three plaintiffs claimed soft-tissue injuries. Brewer defended that the collision was too minor to cause injury.

Tried on damages only, the claims of both Catrina and Krystal were rejected. Robinson took \$1,150. A consistent judgment followed.

Plaintiffs sought JNOV relief, arguing the verdict was inconsistent with the proof of injury. The motion was denied. Plaintiff's counsel was also hit with a sanction of \$400 for failing to be prepared for a final pre-trial conference.

---

**FIRST AMENDMENT**

*California Northern District - San Jose*

**Circus protesters alleged an arena management company and the city of San Jose, CA conspired to deprive their First Amendment rights and arrest them falsely**

**Caption:** *Cuviello et al v. HP Pavilion Management et al*, 5:04-82

**Plaintiff:** G. Whitney Leigh, *Gonzalez & Leigh*,  
San Francisco, CA

**Defense:** Michael J. Dodson, *Assistant City Attorney*, San Jose, CA for City of San Jose  
Frank R. Ubhaus, *Berliner Cohen*, San Jose, CA for HP Pavilion Management

**Verdict:** \$4,800 for plaintiffs assessed against HP Pavilion only; City of San Jose prevailed

**Judge:** James Ware

**Date:** January 19, 2006

**Facts:** The Ringling Brothers Circus came to San Jose in September of 2003. It was to be housed at the HP Pavilion, an arena operated by a management company with the same name. HP Pavilion was concerned, even before the circus arrived, about ne'er do well animal rights protesters who had previously objected to the circus's treatment of animals.

In an attempt to nip it in the bud, HP Pavilion officials had an 8-28-03 meeting to deal with the problem. A plan was conceived. HP Pavilion would arrest any protesters that showed

up – the San Jose police would then take custody of the protesters.

The key event in this case occurred on 9-3-03. The circus was in the process of conducting an open house in the arena parking lot. While tickets were issued and purportedly required, all but two visitors were admitted without their tickets being checked. [There were some fifty other protesters in the area, but their conduct was not implicated in this matter.]

HP Pavilion did enforce the ticket policy as to two protesters, Joseph CuvIELLO and Denize Bolbol. Both had been handing out anti-circus pamphlets in the open-air parking lot. When the protesters indicated they didn't have a ticket and refused to leave, an HP Pavilion employee made a citizen's arrest. The San Jose police were called and both CuvIELLO and Bolbol were taken into custody on trespassing charges.

This civil rights suit followed, CuvIELLO and Bolbol raising two claims: (1) HP Pavilion and San Jose conspired to deprive their First Amendment rights, and (2) that they were falsely arrested. [The second count advanced against HP Pavilion only – the court granted a judgment as a matter of law for the plaintiffs, the jury only considering damages in this regard.] On the conspiracy claim, plaintiffs alleged the illegal conduct resulted from a joint enterprise by the arena and San Jose to deprive their rights.

San Jose flatly denied the allegations. HP Pavilion also defended that it acted reasonably to expel the protesters – it noted that CuvIELLO and Bolbol didn't have tickets and when asked to move to the sidewalk, they refused. [Plaintiffs countered the open-air parking lot was a public forum and they were excluded not because they didn't have tickets, but rather because of the content of their speech.]

**Jury Instructions/Verdict:** The jury's first verdict form exonerated San Jose – it found the conduct was not committed by a city official. The jury went on to find for the plaintiffs on the free speech claim. Both took \$1,200.

Then to false arrest, a judgment as a matter of law having been granted, the plaintiffs again took \$1,200 each. The combined verdict for CuvIELLO and Bolbol totaled \$4,800.

---